

I. Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiments

Conclusions

Image observations in data assimilation

F.X. Le Dimet, I. Souopgui, O. Titaud, A. Vidard

Team - project INRIA MOISE French Research Agency project ADDISA Laboratoire Jean Kuntzmann, Grenoble, France

http://addisa.gforge.inria.fr



ADAMS meeting, Paris, october 29, 2009



Images assimilation I. Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images observations, classical use in DA

Direct Image Sequences Assimilation

Numerical Experiments

Conclusions and Future works



	Images assimilation
Data Assimilation	I. Souopgui
Images observations, classical use in DA	Data Assimilation
Direct Image Sequences Assimilation	Assimilation o Image Sequences
	Numerical Experiments
	Conclusions
Numerical Experiments	

Data Assimilation



Images assimilation

I. Souopgui



Forecast is produced by integration of a model from an initial state

Data Assimilation





- Forecast is produced by integration of a model from an initial state
- Data Assimilation combines in a coherent manner all the available informations in order to retrieve an optimal initial state and then perform a forecast:
 - Mathematical and physical information : model
 - In-situ and remote measurements of the true state
 - A priori knowledges (background, errors ...)



Souopgui

The state of the flow is governed by a partial differential system

$$\begin{cases} \frac{\partial \mathbf{X}}{\partial t} &= \mathcal{M}(\mathbf{X}) \\ \mathbf{X}(0) &= \mathbf{U} \end{cases}$$
 U : initial state

Cost function

$$J(\mathbf{X}_0) = \frac{1}{2} \int_0^T \|\mathcal{H}[\mathbf{X}] - \mathbf{Y}^{\circ}\|_{\mathcal{O}}^2 + \frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{X}_0 - \mathbf{X}^{\mathbf{b}}\|_{\mathcal{X}}^2$$

Adjoint (backward) model

$$\begin{cases} \frac{\partial \mathbf{P}}{\partial t} + \left[\frac{\partial \mathcal{M}}{\partial \mathbf{X}}\right]^T \cdot \mathbf{P} &= \left[\frac{\partial \mathcal{H}}{\partial \mathbf{X}}\right]^T \cdot (\mathcal{H}[\mathbf{X}] - \mathbf{y}_{obs}) \\ \mathbf{P}(T) &= \mathbf{0} \end{cases}$$

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiments



I. Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiment

Conclusions

Data Assimilation

Images observations, classical use in DA

Direct Image Sequences Assimilation

Taken into account images in 4D-VAR Characteristics and modelling of images and image Se

Direct Image Sequences assimilation

Numerical Experiments

Description Twin experiment Real images experime

Image operators

Conclusions and Future works

Image observations : satellite images Meteorology : structures evolution

Structure's dynamic into MÉTÉOSAT images (visible channel)



April 28, 2008, 14H00



April 28, 2008, 20h00



April 29, 2008, 02H00 Source : Meteo France



April 28, 2008, 08h00

Images assimilation

Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiment

Image observations : satellite images Meteorology : extreme events precursor



Evolution of a Dry Intrusion



Fig 3.6(a). 19 December 1998 at 1200 UTC, also indicated 'Z' the expanding dark zone.



Fig 3.6(b). 19 December 1998 at 1800 UTC, also indicated 'D' the dark slot.



Fig 3.6(c). 20 December 1998 at 0000 UTC, also indicated 'S' the dark slot.



Fig 3.6(d). 20 December 1998 at 1200 UTC, also indicated 'V' the dark spiral.

- Water Vapor Canal (MÉTÉOSAT)
- Evolution of a Dry Intrusion (24 hours)
- From a common anomaly to a cyclogenesis

(Santurette and Georgiev, 2005)

Images assimilation

Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

> Numerical Experiments

Image observations : satellite images

- Satellite image sequences provide
 - A large amount of High Resolution data, (available where other sources are not)
 - A global cover of the system (geostationary satellites)
 - The evolution of some structures such as vortices, eddies, fronts or filaments
 - Informations on genesis and evolution of Extreme Events (Tropical cyclone, Hurricanes, ...)
- Currently, images and sequences of images are underused (specialist's interpretations and pseudo-observations)
 - Satellite measurements are expensive
- Application fields : Meteorology, oceanography, atmospheric sciences, hydrology, glaciology, astrophysics, medicine,...

AGENTINGTONE OF IN HEIGHOF

Images assimilation

Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiment:

Images in DA : Pseudo observations technique





- Estimated velocity fields may be used as observations
- Pseudo-obs. transforms Lagrangian informations into Eulerian informations

(G. Korotaev, E. Huot et al., 2008), (D. Auroux and M. Masmoudi, 2006), (B. Horn and B. Schunck, 1981)



Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Taken into account images in 4D-VAR

Characteristics and modelling of images and image Sequences Direct Image

Sequences assimilation

Numerical Experiments

Conclusions

Data Assimilation

Images observations, classical use in DA

Direct Image Sequences Assimilation

Taken into account images in 4D-VAR Characteristics and modelling of images and image Sequences Direct Image Sequences assimilation

Numerical Experiments

Description

Pool images experime

Image operators

Conclusions and Future works

Image Sequences in variational DA

Image sequences are assimilated into the Optimality System





Images assimilation

Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Taken into account images in 4D-VAR

Characteristics and modelling of images and image Sequences Direct Image Sequences assimilation

Numerical Experiments

Conclusions

Pseudo physical observations are avoided

Image Sequences in variational DA : cost function?



Images assimilation

Souopgui



Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Taken into account images in 4D-VAR

Characteristics and modelling of images and image Sequences Direct Image Sequences assimilation

Numerical Experiments

Conclusions

Cost function :
$$J(\mathbf{X}_0) =$$

$$\underbrace{\frac{1}{2} \int_0^T \|\mathcal{H}[\mathbf{X}] - \mathbf{Y}^o\|_{\mathcal{O}}^2 dt + \frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{X}_0 - \mathbf{X}^b\|_{\mathcal{X}}^2}_{\text{classical cost function } J_o} + \frac{1}{2} \int_0^T \|\mathcal{H}_{\mathcal{S}}[\mathbf{X}] - \mathbf{Y}^{I_{\mathcal{S}}}\|_{\mathcal{S}}^2 dt}_{\text{image cost function } J_I}$$

Challenge : define/choose pertinent

- image space S with norm $\|.\|_S$
- image observation \mathbf{Y}^{I_S}
- \blacktriangleright image observation operator $\mathcal{H}_{\mathcal{S}}$

Image Sequences in variational DA : cost function?



Images assimilation

Souopgui



Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Taken into account images in 4D-VAR

Characteristics and modelling of images and image Sequences Direct Image Sequences assimilation

Numerical Experiments

Conclusions

Cost function :
$$J(\mathbf{X}_0) =$$

$$\underbrace{\frac{1}{2} \int_0^T \|\mathcal{H}[\mathbf{X}] - \mathbf{Y}^o\|_{\mathcal{O}}^2 dt + \frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{X}_0 - \mathbf{X}^b\|_{\mathcal{X}}^2}_{\text{classical cost function } J_o} + \frac{1}{2} \int_0^T \|\mathcal{H}_{\mathcal{S}}[\mathbf{X}] - \mathbf{Y}^{I_{\mathcal{S}}}\|_{\mathcal{S}}^2 dt}_{\text{image cost function } J_i}$$

Challenge : define/choose pertinent

- image space S with norm $\|.\|_S$
- ▶ image observation **Y**^{*I*₅}
- image observation operator $\mathcal{H}_{\mathcal{S}}$

Images and image Sequences characteristics



Images assimilation

Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Taken into account images in 4D-VAR

Characteristics and modelling of images and image Sequences

Direct Image Sequences assimilation

Numerical Experiments

Conclusions

Images are :

- Indirect observation of the system(atmosphere/sea) state
 ⇒ IR radiation for satellite images
- 2D "projection" of the 3D system

Image sequence, dynamic information

- avalaible only on edges (discontinuities)
- undefined in homogeneous area
- unavalaible along edges

 \Rightarrow regularization functions

- Interpretation levels
 - Pixel (low) level : unstructured information, depends a lot on the underlying physical processes, strong error correlation between pixels
 - Analysis (high) level: structured information, less depends on the underlying physics, information dominated by the dynamics



MODIS Black Sea Infrared Image (temperature)



MODIS Black Sea Optical Image (ocean color)



Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Taken into account images in 4D-VAR

Characteristics and modelling of images and image Sequences

Direct Image Sequences assimilation

Numerical Experiments

Conclusions

Mathematical framework

multi-scale decomposition (wavelets, curvelets, ...) - Partial Differential Equation framework - Stochastic approach

Image sequences : may be considered as a 3 dimentional data



Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Taken into account images in 4D-VAR

Characteristics and modelling of images and image Sequences

Direct Image Sequences assimilation

Numerical Experiments

Conclusions

Proposition : define

- high level (well-suited to images charateristics) space S for images and image sequences observation cost function
- \blacktriangleright adequate image operators $\mathcal{H}_{\mathcal{F}\to\mathcal{S}}$ that map classical image space to the new one
- ▶ image observation operator $\mathcal{H}_S = \mathcal{H}_{X \to S}$ that map state variables to the new space

Application

- Image operators : multi-scale decompositions
- - considering image as passive tracer evolvind under the system dynamic $\mathcal{H}_{\mathcal{S}} = \mathcal{H}_{\mathcal{X} \rightarrow \mathcal{V}} \circ \mathcal{H}_{\mathcal{F} \rightarrow \mathcal{S}}$
 - modelling radiative transfert / underlying observations direct operator $\mathcal{H}_S = \mathcal{H}_{\mathcal{X} \to S}$



Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

> Taken into account images in 4D-VAR

Characteristics and modelling of images and image

Direct Image Sequences

Sequences assimilation

Numerical Experiments

Conclusions

satellite images = IR radiation measured by satellites. signals are well described in terms of frequential characteristics

- fourier transform for global study of the signal
- (limited-support) multi-scale transform for global and local study
 - wavelet (and is isotropic 2D adaption) well-suited for 1D signal analysis
 - survelet (anisotropic 2D decomposition) well-suited for 2D signals

Image operators Curvelets



satellite images = IR radiation measured by satellites. signals are well described in terms of frequential characteristics

- fourier transform for global study of the signal
- (limited-support) multi-scale transform for global and local study
 - wavelet (and is isotropic 2D adaption) well-suited for 1D signal analysis
 - survelet (anisotropic 2D decomposition) well-suited for 2D signals

Multi-scale, multi-orientation transformation with atoms indexed with a position parameter

$$T = \sum_{j,k,l} \langle \mathbf{f}, \varphi_{j,l,k} \rangle \varphi_{j,l,k}$$



Curvelet atom $\varphi_{j,l,k}$



Scaling, rotations and translations

(E. J. Candès and D. L. Donoho, 2004), (L. Demanet 2006)

Images assimilation

Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

> Taken into account images in 4D-VAR

Characteristics and modelling of images and image Sequences

Direct Image Sequences assimilation

Numerical Experiments



satellite images = IR radiation measured by satellites. signals are well described in terms of frequential characteristics

- fourier transform for global study of the signal
- (limited-support) multi-scale transform for global and local study
 - wavelet (and is isotropic 2D adaption) well-suited for 1D signal analysis
 - curvelet (anisotropic 2D decomposition) well-suited for 2D signals

Curvelet transform is well adapted for signals with 2D discontinuities

Wavelets

Curvelets



 $\|\mathbf{f} - \hat{\mathbf{f}}_m\| \approx m^{-1} \qquad \|\mathbf{f} - \hat{\mathbf{f}}_m\| \approx Cm^{-2}(\log m)^3$

(E. J. Candès and D. L. Donoho, 2004), (L. Demanet 2006)

Images assimilation

Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Taken into account images in 4D-VAR

Characteristics and modelling of images and image Sequences

Direct Image Sequences assimilation

Numerical Experiments



I. Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Taken into account images in 4D-VAR

Characteristics and modelling of images and image

Direct Image Sequences assimilation

Numerical Experiments

Conclusions

satellite images = IR radiation measured by satellites. signals are well described in terms of frequential characteristics

- fourier transform for global study of the signal
- (limited-support) multi-scale transform for global and local study
 - wavelet (and is isotropic 2D adaption) well-suited for 1D signal analysis
 - survelet (anisotropic 2D decomposition) well-suited for 2D signals
- Pixel basis : spatial correlation may be difficult to take into account; adequate denoising functions and well modelled covariance matrices could achieve this(!)
- Multi-scale decompositions
 - spatial correlation is automatically managed by coarse scale elements
 - J local effects are emphasized by fine scale elements

adequate thresholding functions are used to reduce observation size (\Rightarrow rapid convergence) whithout (necessarily) degrading the signal quality



Data Assimilation

Images observations, classical use in DA

Direct Image Sequences Assimilation

Taken into account images in 4D-VAR Characteristics and modelling of images and image Sequences Direct Image Sequences assimilation

Numerical Experiments

Description Twin experiment Real images experiment Image operators

Conclusions and Future works

Images assimilation

Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiments

Description Twin experiment Real images experiment Image operato

Motivation : vortex motion in a rotating platform J.-B. Flór (LEGI) and I. Eames, 2002





Coriolis Platform LEGI, Grenoble



Simulation of an isolated vortex in the atmosphere







Images assimilation

I. Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiments Description

Twin experiment Real images experiment Image operators

 $\mathcal{E}_{\mathcal{F} \rightarrow \mathcal{S}}(f) = \mathsf{Threshold}$ of the Curvelet Transform of the image f

Multi-scale, multi-orientation transformation with atoms indexed with a position parameter

Decomposition :
$$\mathbf{f} = \sum_{j,k,l} \langle \mathbf{f}, \varphi_{j,l,k} \rangle \varphi_{j,l,k}$$

• Threshold :
$$\mathcal{T}(\mathbf{f}) = \sum_{(j,k,l) \in E} \langle \mathbf{f}, \varphi_{j,l,k} \rangle \varphi_{j,l,k}$$



Images assimilation

Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiments Description Twin experiment

Real images experiment Image operators



Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiments Description

Twin experiment Real images experiment Image operators

Conclusions

$\mathcal{E}_{\mathcal{F} \rightarrow \mathcal{S}}(f) = \mathsf{Threshold}$ of the Curvelet Transform of the image f

Multi-scale, multi-orientation transformation with atoms indexed with a position parameter

9 Decomposition :
$$\mathbf{f} = \sum_{j,k,l} \langle \mathbf{f}, \varphi_{j,l,k} \rangle \varphi_{j,l,k}$$

• Threshold :
$$\mathcal{T}(\mathbf{f}) = \sum_{(j,k,l) \in E} \langle \mathbf{f}, \varphi_{j,l,k} \rangle \varphi_{j,l,k}$$

- ► Fast Discrete Curvelet Transform (FDCT) implementations run in O(n² log n) for n × n cartesian arrays (www.curvelet.org) (C++, C++//, MatlabTM)
- Adjoint curvelet transform = inverse curvelet transform

Model and Observation operator Lagrangian data assimilation



Evolution of the state vector $x = (\mathbf{u}, \mathbf{v}, \mathbf{h})$: shallow-water model

$$\partial_t u - u \partial_x u + v \partial_y u - fv + g \partial_x h + \mathcal{D}(u) = \mathcal{F}_u$$

$$\partial_t v + u \partial_x v + v \partial_y v + fu + g \partial_y h + \mathcal{D}(v) = \mathcal{F}_v$$

$$\partial_t h + \partial_x (hu) + \partial_y (hv) = 0$$

Tracer transport equation : (concentration **q**)

$$\partial_t \mathbf{q} + u \partial_x \mathbf{q} + v \partial_y \mathbf{q} - \nu_T \Delta \mathbf{q} = \mathbf{0}$$

Syntetic Image Sequence : $\mathcal{I}_{\mathcal{X}
ightarrow \mathcal{F}}[\mathbf{u}, \mathbf{v}, \mathbf{v}]$

Observation Operator

 $\mathcal{I}_{\mathcal{X}\to\mathcal{S}} = \mathcal{E}_{\mathcal{F}\to\mathcal{S}} \circ \mathcal{I}_{\mathcal{X}\to\mathcal{F}} = \mathcal{T}(\mathsf{FDCT}[\mathbf{q}])$

assimilation

Images

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiments Description Twin experiment Real images experiment Image operators

Conclusions

Cost function

 $J(X_0) = \alpha_o \int_0^T \|\mathcal{T}(FDCT[\mathbf{f}]) - \mathcal{T}(FDCT[\mathbf{q}])\|_{\mathcal{S}}^2 dt + \alpha_b \|X_0\|_{\mathcal{X}}^2, \quad \alpha_b \lll \alpha_o$

Model and Observation operator Lagrangian data assimilation



Evolution of the state vector $x = (\mathbf{u}, \mathbf{v}, \mathbf{h})$: shallow-water model

$$\partial_t u - u \partial_x u + v \partial_y u - fv + g \partial_x h + \mathcal{D}(u) = \mathcal{F}_u$$

$$\partial_t v + u \partial_x v + v \partial_y v + fu + g \partial_y h + \mathcal{D}(v) = \mathcal{F}_v$$

$$\partial_t h + \partial_x (hu) + \partial_y (hv) = 0$$

Observation Operator

Tracer transport equation : (concentration **q**) $\partial_t \mathbf{q} + u \partial_x \mathbf{q} + v \partial_y \mathbf{q} - \nu_T \Delta \mathbf{q} = 0$

Syntetic Image Sequence : $\mathcal{I}_{\mathcal{X} \to \mathcal{F}}[\mathbf{u}, \mathbf{v}, \mathbf{h}] = \mathbf{q}$

 $\text{Observation Operator} \quad \mathcal{H}_{\mathcal{X} \to \mathcal{S}} = \mathcal{E}_{\mathcal{F} \to \mathcal{S}} \circ \mathcal{I}_{\mathcal{X} \to \mathcal{F}} = \mathcal{T} \big(\text{FDCT}[\textbf{q}] \big)$

Cost function

 $J(X_0) = \alpha_o \int_0^T \|\mathcal{T}(FDCT[\mathbf{f}]) - \mathcal{T}(FDCT[\mathbf{q}])\|_{\mathcal{S}}^2 dt + \alpha_b \|X_0\|_{\mathcal{X}}^2, \quad \alpha_b \ll \infty_o$

Images assimilation

I. Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiments Description Twin experiment Real images experiment Image operators

Model and Observation operator Lagrangian data assimilation



Evolution of the state vector $x = (\mathbf{u}, \mathbf{v}, \mathbf{h})$: shallow-water model

$$\partial_t u - u \partial_x u + v \partial_y u - fv + g \partial_x h + \mathcal{D}(u) = \mathcal{F}_u$$

$$\partial_t v + u \partial_x v + v \partial_y v + fu + g \partial_y h + \mathcal{D}(v) = \mathcal{F}_v$$

$$\partial_t h + \partial_x (hu) + \partial_y (hv) = 0$$

Observation Operator

Tracer transport equation : (concentration **q**) $\partial_t \mathbf{q} + u \partial_x \mathbf{q} + v \partial_y \mathbf{q} - \nu_T \Delta \mathbf{q} = 0$

Syntetic Image Sequence : $\mathcal{I}_{\mathcal{X} \to \mathcal{F}}[\mathbf{u}, \mathbf{v}, \mathbf{h}] = \mathbf{q}$

$$\text{bservation Operator} \quad \mathcal{H}_{\mathcal{X} \to \mathcal{S}} = \mathcal{E}_{\mathcal{F} \to \mathcal{S}} \circ \mathcal{I}_{\mathcal{X} \to \mathcal{F}} = \mathcal{T}(\mathsf{FDCT}[\mathbf{q}])$$

Cost function

C

$$J(X_0) = \alpha_o \int_0^T \|\mathcal{T}(FDCT[\mathbf{f}]) - \mathcal{T}(FDCT[\mathbf{q}])\|_{\mathcal{S}}^2 dt + \alpha_b \|X_0\|_{\mathcal{X}}^2, \quad \alpha_b \lll \alpha_o$$

Images assimilation

I. Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiments Description Twin experiment Real images experiment Image operators

Twin experiment



Images assimilation

Image and True Velocity Field (0 h) Image and True Velocity Field (12 h) Image and True Velocity Field (24 h) 2.00 _____ 2.00 _____ 200 _____ axis (m) (m) sho axas (m) 1.80 1.80 1.80 along South-North 1.60 -1.60 1.60 Duo 1.40 1.40 1.40 Istance (1.20 -1.20 stan 1.20 1.40 1.60 1.80 2.00 2.20 1.40 1.60 1.80 2.00 2.20 1.40 1.60 1.80 2.00 2 20 Distance along West-East axis (m) Distance along West-East axis (m) Distance along West-East axis (m) mage and Analyzed Velocity Field (0 h) Image and Analyzed Velocity Field (12 h) mage and Forecasted Velocity Field (24 h) 2.00 _____ 200 -----2.00 _____ axis (m) axis (m) 1.80 ds (1.80 1.80 North 1.60 -1.60 1.60 along South Buo 1.40 1.40 1.40 Distance a Distance 1.20 1.20 -. 1.60 1.80 2.00 2.20 1.60 1.80 2.00 2.00 1.40 1.40 2.20 1.40 1.60 1.80 2.20 Distance along West-East axis (m) Distance along West-East axis (m) Distance along West-East axis (m) t = 0ht = 3ht = 6h

I. Souopgui

Twin

Error analysis



Images assimilation

Souopgui



Barron angular error



Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiments Description Twin experiment Real images experiment

Image operator

Real images experiment





Images assimilation

Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiments

Twin experiment

Real images experiment









Images

- Assimilation of Image Sequences
- Numerical Experiments Description Twin experiment Real images experiment Image operators



Thresholding







	Images assimilation
Data Assimilation	I. Souopgu
Images observations, classical use in DA	Data Assimilation
Direct Image Sequences Assimilation	Images Assimilation o Image Sequences
	Numerical Experiments
	Conclusions
Numerical Experiments	



Images assimilation

Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiments

Conclusions

- Image Sequences have a strong predictive potential but are still underused by numerical systems
- Pseudo observation techniques retrieve observations of state variables from images (estimated velocity fields)
- Direct Assimilation of Sequences of Images combines image-type information conistently with the underlying physical model
- DISA is based on high level images representation
- adequate threshold functions reduce obs size and ensure rapid convergence



Images assimilation

Souopgui

Data Assimilation

Images

Assimilation of Image Sequences

Numerical Experiments

Conclusions

Conclusions

- Image Sequences have a strong predictive potential but are still underused by numerical systems
- Pseudo observation techniques retrieve observations of state variables from images (estimated velocity fields)
- Direct Assimilation of Sequences of Images combines image-type information constently with the underlying physical model
- DISA is based on high level images representation
- adequate threshold functions reduce obs size and ensure rapid convergence

Future works

- Somparison with pseudo-observation technique
- Analysis of threholding functions
- Going to more realistic problem